

Contents

Part I Challenges of Competition Law in Developing Countries and the WAEMU, the AndeanC and the CARICOM

1	Overview of the WAEMU, the AndeanC and the CARICOM	3
1.1	General History of Integration in the WAEMU, AndeanC and CARICOM	3
1.1.1	WAEMU	3
1.1.2	AndeanC	5
1.1.3	CARICOM	7
1.2	Development of Regional Competition Policy in the WAEMU, AndeanC and CARICOM and Main Enforcement Difficulties	10
1.2.1	WAEMU	10
1.2.2	AndeanC	11
1.2.3	CARICOM	14
2	Competition Law in Developing Countries	15
2.1	Competition Policy and Development	15
2.2	Taxonomy of Competition Law Enforcement Difficulties in Developing Countries	18
2.2.1	Economy Related Enforcement Difficulties	18
2.2.2	Politically Related Enforcement Difficulties	26
2.2.3	Socio-Cultural Enforcement Difficulties in Developing Countries	28
2.2.4	Lack of Formal Cooperation Mechanisms on the International Level	30
3	Terms and Premises of Regional Competition Law Enforcement	33
3.1	Taxonomy of Institutional Design in Regional Competition Law Enforcement	33
3.2	The Multi-Layered Notion of 'Enforcement' in Competition Law	35

3.3	Measuring the Efficiency of Regional Competition Law Enforcement in RTAs Among Developing Countries	36
4	Structure of the Study	39
 Part II The Institutional Design of Regional Competition Law Enforcement in the WAEMU, AndeanC and CARICOM		
5	Dimension I: The Content of Substantive Law	43
5.1	Core Substantive Competition Law Provisions	43
5.1.1	Anticompetitive Agreements and Abuse of Dominant Position	43
5.1.2	Subjective Scope of Application	43
5.1.3	Dealing with State-Related Behaviour and Public Undertakings	44
5.1.4	Regional Merger Regulation	52
5.1.5	Territorial Scope of Application	57
5.1.6	Exemptions	68
5.1.7	Summary of Substantive Regional Competition Law Provisions	73
5.2	Current Framework of National Competition Law Regimes	74
5.2.1	Taxonomy of National Competition Law Regimes in the WAEMU	75
5.2.2	Taxonomy of National Competition Law Regimes in the AndeanC	78
5.2.3	Taxonomy of National Competition Law Regimes in the CARICOM	86
5.3	Regional Competition Law Objectives and Their Embeddedness	97
5.3.1	Regional Competition Law Objectives	98
5.3.2	Horizontal Embeddedness: State of Implementation of the Common Market and Congruence with General Goals of Regional Integration	103
5.3.3	Vertical Embeddedness: Congruence with National Interests and Economic Policies	116
6	Dimension II: Legislative Competence on Competition Law	123
6.1	Unification of Laws Through a Wide Definition of the Territorial Scope of Application: The Case of WAEMU	123
6.1.1	Implications on Member States with Existing and Operative National Competition Law Systems	126
6.1.2	Implications on Member States Without Prior or Operative National Competition Law Systems, Including Member States with Prior Sectorial Regulation	131

- 6.1.3 Summary of the Unification of Substantive Laws in the WAEMU 132
 - 6.2 Convergent Standards Through Minimum or Partial Harmonization of Substantive Laws: The Case of CARICOM 134
 - 6.2.1 Obligation to Enact National Substantive Competition Laws and a National Competition Authority for the Member States as Subjects of International Law in the CARICOM 135
 - 6.2.2 Implications for National Competition Law Regimes with Existing Competition Laws 144
 - 6.2.3 Implications for Member States Without Prior National Competition Law Regimes 145
 - 6.2.4 Summary of Convergent Standards Through Minimum or Partial Harmonization in a System of International Law 147
 - 6.3 “Soft” Harmonization Through Non-Binding Guidelines: The Case of the AndeanC 148
 - 6.3.1 Obligation to Establish a National Authority in the AndeanC in Charge of the Application of Regional Competition Law 149
 - 6.3.2 The “Downloading Option” in the AndeanC 150
 - 6.3.3 Implications for Member States Without Competition Laws 152
 - 6.3.4 Implications for Existing Competition Law Systems in the Member States 158
 - 6.3.5 Summary of “Soft Harmonization” Through Non-Binding Guidelines in the AndeanC 160
- 7 **Dimension III: Organization of Enforcing Agencies** 163
 - 7.1 Regional Competition Law Authorities 163
 - 7.1.1 Specialized Independent Commission Model: The CARICOM Example 164
 - 7.1.2 Non-Specialized Directorate Model: The Andean Example 169
 - 7.1.3 Specialized Directorate Model: The Case of the WAEMU 173
 - 7.2 National Competition Authorities Prior and After the Installation of the Regional Competition Authority 178
 - 7.2.1 National Competition Law Structures 178
 - 7.2.2 National Competition Law Enforcement and National Sectorial Regulation 180
 - 7.2.3 Conclusions on National Competition Law Enforcement and Institutional Structures 182

8	Dimension IV: Enforcement Procedures of Regional Competition Law in the Narrow Sense	183
8.1	Regional Competition Law Enforcement Procedures	184
8.1.1	Regional Competition Law Investigations	184
8.1.2	Conduct of and Powers During Investigations	198
8.1.3	Decision-Making Power and Its Implementation	204
8.1.4	Advocacy Function and Competition Promotion	216
8.2	Cooperation Mechanisms with National Structures	221
8.2.1	Specialized Inter-governmental Cooperation Bodies	221
8.2.2	General Cooperation and Policy Coordination Policy Bodies: CARICOM's Council of Trade and Economic Development	240
8.3	Control of Regional Competition Law Enforcement	247
8.3.1	Administrative Appeal	247
8.3.2	Judicial Appeal Through a Regional Court of Justice	248
9	Dimension V: General Legal Principles Governing the Allocation of Competences in RTAs and the Notion of Time	271
9.1	The Principles of Direct Application and Direct Effect of Regional Competition Law	272
9.2	Primacy of Regional Law in Exclusive, Concurrent or Parallel Competition Law Enforcement	273
9.2.1	Exclusive, Concurrent or Parallel Competition Law Enforcement in RTAs	273
9.2.2	Primacy of Community Competition Law in a System of Centralized and Exclusive Application	274
9.2.3	Primacy of Community Competition Law in a System of Concurrent Application	275
9.2.4	Primacy in a System of Parallel Competition Law Enforcement and in a Dualist System	276
9.3	The Principles of Effectiveness and Equivalence	278
9.4	The Principle of Subsidiarity	279
9.5	The Principle of Procedural and Institutional Autonomy in the Application of Regional Competition Law and Policy	280
9.6	Mandatory Lead Jurisdiction	282
9.7	Quantitative Thresholds	284
9.8	Conclusions on the General Legal Principles Governing the Allocation of Competences in RTAs	285
10	Dimension VI: The Notion of Time—Adaptability and Sustainability of Regional Competition Law Enforcement	287
10.1	General Legal Adaptability of the Regional Competition Law System	287
10.2	Timing of Regional Competition Law Implementation	290

**Part III The Optimal Degree of Centralization and Decentralization:
Evaluation of the Three Regional Competition Law Systems
with Regard to the Enforcement of Competition Law
in Developing Countries**

11 General Conclusions on the Efficacy of a Regional Competition Law System	297
11.1 The Dynamic Relationship Between Regional and National Competition Policy	297
11.2 From Regional to International Economic Integration: Creating a Common Market	300
11.2.1 Redefining the Common Market in Developing Countries	300
11.2.2 Public vs. Private Restraints to Inter-state Trade Between Developing Countries	304
11.2.3 The Overarching Incentive of a Common Market for Regional Competition Law Enforcement	305
11.2.4 Larger Integration and Open Regionalism: Opportunities or Threats to RTAs in Developing Countries?	307
11.3 Creating a Credible Threat: In Particular with Regard to International Anticompetitive Practices	308
11.3.1 The Relevance of the Creation of a Common Market	308
11.3.2 Increasing the Political Weight of a Competition Authority's Decisions	309
11.3.3 Necessity to Provide Regional Competition Authority with Sufficient Enforcement Powers	310
11.4 Increasing Legal Certainty and Convergence	311
11.4.1 The Relevance of Harmonization of Competition Law and Policy Within an RTA Among Developing Countries	312
11.4.2 The Importance of Harmonization in Attracting Foreign Direct Investment (FDI) and the Intensification of Intra-community Trade	316
11.4.3 Different Forms and Consequences of Imperfect Harmonization	317
11.5 The Competition Authority's Independence with Regard to Competition Law Enforcement in Developing Countries	321
11.5.1 Furthering Greater Independence in Regional and National Competition Law Enforcement	321
11.5.2 The Difficult Notion of Independence of Competition Authorities in Developing Countries	323
11.6 Overcoming the Lack of Resources in RTAs Consisting of Developing Countries	326
11.6.1 The Interdependence Between the Attribution of Competences and the Required Resources	326

11.6.2	The Lack of Skilled Staff	327
11.6.3	Preconditions for Network Efficiencies	329
11.6.4	Cumulative Sanctions as an Increased Deterrent Effect?	330
11.7	Creating and Promoting a Competition Culture	331
11.7.1	The Necessity to Establish a National Competition Law Culture	331
11.7.2	The Necessity to Establish a Competition Law Culture with Regard to Regional Competition Law	333
11.8	The Problem of Accessibility and Private Enforcement	335
11.8.1	Accessibility of Regional Competition Authorities in Infringement Procedures of Regional Competition Law	335
11.8.2	The Role of National Judges in Private Enforcement of Regional Competition Law	337
11.9	The Political Dimension of Regional Competition Law Enforcement	339
11.10	The Importance of Preserving Flexibility in the Framework of a Regional Competition Law Structure	341
11.11	General Conclusions	343
12	The Optimal Degree of Centralization or Decentralization: Recommendations for and Implications of Certain Institutional Designs	345
12.1	Dimension I: Vertical Allocation of Competences Through the Content of Regional Substantive Competition Law	345
12.1.1	Territorial Scope of Application: The Requirement of Cross-Border Trade	345
12.1.2	The Notion of Appreciable Effect and the De-Minimis Clause	348
12.1.3	Dealing with State-Related Anticompetitive Practices ...	349
12.1.4	The Inclusion of Individual Exceptions, Exemptions and Special and Differential Treatment Provisions	349
12.1.5	Objectives of Regional Competition Law	350
12.1.6	The Inclusion of Regional Merger Policy	351
12.1.7	Competition Advocacy	352
12.2	Dimension II: Implications for the Vertical Allocation of Competition Law Competences	353
12.2.1	Implementation of National Competition Law Structures: Informal Incentives vs. Obligations	353
12.2.2	Range of Implementation Obligations and Learning Direction: Top-down and Bottom-up	355
12.2.3	Incentives for Member States to Harmonize National Substantive Competition Law	356

12.2.4	Regional Obligations on National Procedural Laws and the National Competition Law Authority's Design	358
12.2.5	Horizontal Demarcation of Competences Between National Sector Regulation and Regional Competition Law	359
12.3	Dimension III: Implications Arising Out of the Institutional Design of a Regional Competition Authority	360
12.4	Dimension IV: Measures to Shape Competition Enforcement Procedures	363
12.4.1	Regional Competition Law Investigations	363
12.4.2	Conducting Regional Competition Law Investigations ...	368
12.4.3	Decision-Making Power and Enforcement	370
12.4.4	The Enforcement of Individual Exceptions	371
12.4.5	Private Enforcement Before National Judiciary	373
12.4.6	Cooperation Mechanisms with National Competition Law Structures	375
12.4.7	Accountability and Ex Post Control of Regional Competition Law Enforcement	378
12.5	Dimension V: Principles of Regional Competition Law Enforcement	380
12.5.1	International Law and Supranational Competition Law Systems	380
12.5.2	The Principles of Effectiveness and Subsidiarity	381
12.5.3	Prerogative Competence Allocation Powers and the Right to Determine the Competent Jurisdiction	382
12.5.4	Principle of Primacy of Regional Law in Exclusive, Concurrent or Parallel Competition Law Enforcement	383
12.6	Dimension VI: Dynamics of Regional Competition Law Enforcement	384
13	Proposal on Re-Allocation of Competences in the WAEMU, AndeanC, CARICOM	387
13.1	WAEMU: "Controlled Decentralization" with Centralized Standards	387
13.2	AndeanC: Strengthening the Advocacy Function of the Secretariat General	392
13.3	CARICOM: Moderate Centralization of Enforcement and Harmonization of Competition Law Standards	397
14	Guidelines on the Institutional Design of Regional Competition Law Enforcement	405
14.1	Number of Member States and Their Economic Heterogeneity	405
14.2	Intra-Community Trade	406

14.3 Particularities of Prevailing Anticompetitive Practices
and Actors 406

14.4 Institutional Capacities and Resources 406

14.5 Existence, Efficacy and Diversity of National Competition
Law Systems 406

14.6 Existence of Competition Culture in Member States 407

14.7 Political Will to Cede Sovereignty 407

14.8 Aspect of Time and Sequencing 407

14.9 Goals of Integration and Regional Competition Law 408

14.10 Existence of a Conflict Resolution Mechanism at the
Regional Level 408

14.11 Degree and Scope of General Integration (Including
Socio-Cultural and Political) 408

Bibliography 409