

Vertical Cooperative Advertising in Supply Chain Management

A Game-Theoretic Analysis



Contributions to Management Science

More information about this series at http://www.springer.com/series/1505

Gerhard Aust

Vertical Cooperative Advertising in Supply Chain Management

A Game-Theoretic Analysis



Gerhard Aust Chair for Industrial Management TU Dresden Dresden Germany

PhD Thesis, TU Dresden, 2014 Originally entitled "Game-theoretic analysis of vertical cooperative advertising in supply chain management"

ISSN 1431-1941 ISSN 2197-716X (electronic)
ISBN 978-3-319-11625-9 ISBN 978-3-319-11626-6 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-11626-6
Springer Cham Heidelberg New York Dordrecht London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2014957308

© Springer International Publishing Switzerland 2015

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

To my beloved wife Katja

Foreword

Principally, the main idea of supply chain management is to collaborate with other firms along the supply chain in order to leverage strategic positioning and to improve operating efficiency. One possible facet of this collaboration—especially along a manufacturer-retailer-supply-chain—is cooperative advertising. While the manufacturer's advertising strategy aims to create a brand image and is long-term oriented, the retailer concentrates on short-term oriented advertising by communicating prices and special offers to customers. The problem may occur that a single retailer is not able to bear local advertising expenditures at a height desired by the manufacturer. Therefore, it can absolutely be in the interest of the manufacturer to support the retailer's advertising financially to increase sales by which the manufacturer profits in the end, too. Such a financial participation is called vertical cooperative advertising, a practice that is very common in a lot of manufacturer-retailer partnership programs.

This outstanding thesis is a cumulative dissertation consisting of four main papers. The first paper represents the first comprehensive literature review on cooperative advertising. This review comprises 110 scientific articles and gives an excellent overview of the state of the art in cooperative advertising. Within the other three papers, Gerhard Aust chooses a game-theoretic approach to analyze manufacturer–retailer supply chains which differ according to demand functions, structure, and distribution of power. He formulates comprehensive mathematical models to determine the advertising participation rate, retail and wholesale prices, local and global advertising expenditures, and profits.

The second paper considers a typical cooperative advertising situation with one manufacturer and one retailer. In contrast to previous articles, Gerhard Aust relaxes the restrictive assumption of identical margins for both players and applies a general demand function leading to differentiated results concerning dominant game structures. The third paper regards a supply chain which consists of one manufacturer and two retailers who sell substitutable products. It is the first time that a cooperative advertising program is applied to such a setting. It turns out that retail competition has harmful effects on each players' profit. However, due to reduced retail prices, customers benefit from this additional competition. In the

viii Foreword

fourth paper fuzzy set theory is applied for the first time to a single-manufacturersingle-retailer supply chain with cooperative advertising to incorporate uncertainty of demand parameters into analysis.

In summary, this dissertation is distinguished by extremely sophisticated mathematical models, intelligent and clean solutions, and detailed managerial interpretation. Moreover, it contributes significantly to understand and to improve cooperative advertising programs. Therefore, I hope that Gerhard Aust's excellent dissertation finds large distribution.

Prof. Dr. Udo Buscher

Acknowledgments

This cumulative PhD thesis was written during my time at the Chair of Business Management, especially Industrial Management, at the TU Dresden, where I have been working as a scientific assistant since 2011. I would like to use this opportunity to express my sincere gratitude to those who accompanied me during the last years.

First and foremost, I thank my supervisor, Prof. Dr. Udo Buscher. Already during my diploma thesis, he convinced me to take also the next academic step and to continue with my research. Despite many appointments and duties, he always offered me any possible support and feedback, whereby he significantly contributed to the success of my dissertation project. Besides all these professional aspects, I really value him personally, as he is always concerned with creating a friendly and pleasant working environment at our chair.

As every (current or former) PhD student knows, a dissertation can often be an all-consuming and even solitary work, making the colleagues all the more important. Without them, the time wouldn't have been as enjoyable as it was and is! Therefore, I am deeply indebted to Ina Bräuer, Kirsten Hoffmann, Birgit Keller, Janis Neufeld, and Carolin Witek for all those professional and nonprofessional discussions, the coffee and lunch breaks, the numerous cakes and—certainly less numerous—sparkling wines during our meetings, and even for those minor and major troubles with computers and printers, which always are a welcome diversion. Furthermore, my former colleague Dr. Christian Ullerich has to be mentioned in particular, not only for his critical and detailed proofreading of my thesis. Finally, I would like to thank Evelyn Krug, who relieves us from these administrative duties and truly is the heart of our team.

My greatest thanks go to my family. To my parents, Angelika and Gerhard, whose absolute support I can rely on in every circumstance and any decision of my life. I owe everything to you and it can hardly be expressed in words what you have done for me! And, last but not least, to my wife Katja, to whom I would like to dedicate this book. Without her endless patience, tolerance, and willingness to share all the

x Acknowledgments

ups and downs and to talk about sometimes really ivory-tower problems even in late hours, this thesis would not have been possible.

Dresden, Germany

Gerhard Aust

Contents

1	Intr	oduction	1
	1.1	Motivation	1
	1.2	Objectives and Research Questions	3
	1.3	Structure of This Work	5
2	Fun	damentals	11
	2.1	The Application of Game Theory	11
		2.1.1 Theoretical Framework	11
		2.1.2 Solution Concepts in Non-Cooperative Game Theory	15
		2.1.3 Solution Concepts in Bargaining Theory	22
	2.2	A General Model of Cooperative Advertising	26
3	Coo	perative Advertising Models in Supply Chain	
	Mai	nagement: A Review	31
	3.1	Introduction	31
	3.2	The Design of Cooperative Advertising Programs	35
	3.3	Cooperative Advertising Models	37
		3.3.1 General Setting	37
		3.3.2 Demand Functions	42
		3.3.3 Game Theory	52
	3.4	Conclusion and Further Research Directions	62
4	Ver	tical Cooperative Advertising and Pricing	
	Dec	isions in a Manufacturer-Retailer Supply Chain:	
	A G	ame-Theoretic Approach	65
	4.1	Introduction	65
	4.2	Four Forms of Retailer-Manufacturer Relationship	69
		4.2.1 Model Formulation	69
		4.2.2 Symmetric and Non-Cooperative Relationship	71
		4.2.3 Asymmetric Relationship with Manufacturer-Leadership	75
		4.2.4 Asymmetric Relationship with Retailer-Leadership	79

xii Contents

		4.2.5 Cooperation	82 86
	4.3		88
	4.3	Discussion of the Results	
		4.3.1 Margins and Prices	88
		4.3.2 Advertising Expenditures and Participation Rate	91
		4.3.3 Profits.	94
		4.3.4 Feasibility of Cooperation Game	96
	4.4	Managerial Implications and Conclusions	98
5		ne Theoretic Analysis of Pricing and Vertical	
		perative Advertising of a Retailer-Duopoly with	
		ommon Manufacturer	101
	5.1	Introduction	101
	5.2	Model Formulation	103
	5.3	Two Forms of Manufacturer-Retailer Relationship	107
		5.3.1 Symmetric Relationship	107
		5.3.2 Manufacturer-Leadership	109
	5.4	Interpretation	113
		5.4.1 General Case with Specific Market Size Parameters	113
		5.4.2 Margins and Prices	114
		5.4.3 Advertising Expenditures and Participation Rate	116
		5.4.4 Profits	117
	5.5	Managerial Implications and Conclusions	119
6		Ianufacturer-Retailer Supply Chain with Fuzzy	
		tomer Demand: A Vertical Cooperative Advertising	
	and	Pricing Model	121
	6.1	Introduction	121
	6.2	Fuzzy Set Theory	122
	6.3	A Manufacturer-Retailer Supply Chain Model with Fuzzy	
		Customer Demand	124
		6.3.1 Model Formulation	124
		6.3.2 A Manufacturer Stackelberg Equilibrium	126
	6.4	Numerical Studies	130
	6.5	Managerial Implications and Conclusions	132
7	Rés	umé	135
Bi	bliog	raphy	141

List of Figures

Fig. 1.1	Advertising participation rates commonly offered	
	by manufacturers	3
Fig. 1.2	Structure of this work	6
Fig. 2.1	Possible properties of a game	13
Fig. 2.2	Determination of Nash equilibrium	18
Fig. 2.3	Determination of Stackelberg equilibrium	21
Fig. 2.4	Determination of Cooperation solution	21
Fig. 2.5	Symmetric and Asymmetric Nash bargaining model	26
Fig. 2.6	A general one-product $(K = 1)$ supply chain with	
	cooperative advertising	28
Fig. 3.1	Number of publications on cooperative advertising by journal	32
Fig. 3.2	Number of publications on cooperative advertising by	
	year (as of August 2013)	33
Fig. 4.1	Manufacturer-retailer supply chain	69
Fig. 4.2	Wholesale price <i>w</i>	89
Fig. 4.3	Retailer margin <i>m</i>	90
Fig. 4.4	Retail price <i>p</i>	91
Fig. 4.5	Ratio of wholesale price w and price p in Retailer	
	Stackelberg equilibrium	92
Fig. 4.6	Manufacturer's global advertising expenditures <i>A</i>	92
Fig. 4.7	Retailer's local advertising expenditures <i>a</i>	93
Fig. 4.8	Manufacturer's advertising participation rate t	94
Fig. 4.9	Manufacturer's profit Π_m	95
Fig. 4.10	Retailer's profit Π_r	95
Fig. 4.11	Total profit Π_{m+r}	96
Fig. 4.12	Feasibility of Cooperation	97
Fig. 4.13	Feasibility of Cooperation with $0 < k \le 3$ and $0 < \nu \le 3$	98
Fig. 5.1	One-manufacturer two-retailer supply chain	105
Fig. 5.2	Comparison of the echelons' advertising expenditures	116

xiv	List of Figures
-----	-----------------

Fig. 5.3	Participation rate t	117
Fig. 5.4	Manufacturer's profit $\Pi_{\rm m}$	118
Fig. 5.5	Retailers' profits Π_{r1} and Π_{r2}	118
Fig. 5.6	Total supply chain profit Π_{m+2r}	119
Fig. 6.1	Manufacturer-retailer supply chain	125

List of Tables

Table 2.1	games (sample)	16
Table 2.2	Outlook of cooperative advertising models used in this work	29
Table 3.1	Total amount of cooperative advertising programs	
	in the United States	36
Table 3.2	General setting	38
Table 3.3	Demand and cost functions (static games)	43
Table 3.4	Demand and cost functions (dynamic games)	50
Table 3.5	Game-theoretic methods (only vertical interaction)	54
Table 3.6	Game-theoretic methods (vertical and horizontal interaction)	57
Table 3.7	Bargaining games	58
Table 4.1	Related cooperative advertising models	67
Table 4.2	List of symbols	68
Table 4.3	Optimal expressions in each game scenario	88
Table 4.4	Numerical example	97
Table 5.1	List of symbols	104
Table 5.2	Framework of numerical analysis	115
Table 5.3	Sensitivity analysis of parameter Θ with $k = 1$	115
Table 5.4	Sensitivity analysis of parameter k with $\Theta = 0.5$	115
Table 6.1	Calculation rules for fuzzy variables	123
Table 6.2	List of symbols	126
Table 6.3	Manufacturer Stackelberg equilibrium	129
Table 6.4	Allocation of linguistic expressions to triangular fuzzy	
	variables	130
Table 6.5	Numerical example with medium $\tilde{\alpha}$, sensitive $\tilde{\beta}$, and	
	low \tilde{k}_{r}	131
Table 6.6	Variation of fuzziness of $\tilde{\alpha}$, with sensitive $\tilde{\beta}$ and low \tilde{k}_r	132